Contact Damage in Brittle Coating Layers: Influence of Surface Curvature

Tarek Qasim,1 Mark B. Bush,1 Xiaozhi Hu,1 Brian R. Lawn2

1School of Mechanical Engineering, The University of Western Australia, Crawley, W.A. 6009, Australia
2Materials Science and Engineering Laboratory, National Institute of Standards and Technology, 100 Bureau Drive, Gaithersburg, Maryland 20899-8500

Abstract: Fracture from indentation by a hard sphere on bilayer systems composed of curved brittle coating layers on compliant polymeric substrates is investigated, in simulation of dental crown structures. Glass plates 1 mm thick are used as representative of enamel/crown layers, and epoxy filler substrates as representative of support dentin. Specimens with curved surfaces are prepared by pressing the glass plates onto steel sphere dies with radius of curvature down to 4 mm, to reflect common occlusal geometries. The influence of curvature on the conditions to initiate and propagate subsurface “radial” cracks, widely believed to be the principal failure mode in ceramic-based dental crowns, is studied. Finite element calculations are used to evaluate stress states in the specimens. It is shown that surface curvature can play an important role in the radial crack evolution, initially by inhibiting initiation but subsequently, in the case of convex curvature, by strongly enhancing propagation to failure. Implications concerning the design of ceramic-based dental crowns are considered. © 2004 Wiley Periodicals, Inc. *J Biomed Mater Res Part B: Appl Biomater 73B: 179 –185, 2005

Keywords: curved surfaces; radial cracks; contact damage; brittle layers; crown failure

INTRODUCTION

Brittle layers on compliant substrates are of high interest for their relevance to dental crowns and other biomechanical implant structures,1–8 as well as to a variety of engineering applications including tribological and electronic packaging devices.9 The combination of a hard, brittle outer layer and a compliant, tough inner layer offers high wear resistance and damage tolerance, factors that are crucial to the lifetime of such structures. Currently, the lifetimes of ceramic-based crowns are unacceptably short,9–13 limited by any one of a number of damage modes that may develop in either the coating or the substrate. Of these modes, radial cracking at the coating undersurface, from flexure induced by concentrated loads at the top surface, has been identified as the most deleterious in the context of system survival.9 These cracks are especially dangerous in thinner coatings (typically <1 mm), because they can spread long distances subsurface, in severe cases to the specimen extremities, resulting in premature failure.

Whereas many studies have been reported on damage modes in brittle/compliant bilayers of the kind under consideration here, virtually all have concentrated on flat surfaces.2–8,14–22 Those studies have enabled determination of dependencies of critical loads for various damage modes on geometrical variables like layer thickness and indenter sphere radius, as well as on material properties like interlayer elastic modulus mismatch, brittle-layer strength, hardness, and toughness. However, teeth and crowns exhibit pronounced curvature and shape irregularities, which can substantially alter stress states and thereby influence critical loads to initiate and propagate radial cracks in the brittle layers. Controlled experiments documenting such effects need to be conducted.

Accordingly, this study aims to measure the effect of changing specimen surface curvature on the evolution of subsurface radial cracks in concentrated top-surface loading. To this end, borosilicate glass plates 1 mm thick are molded over steel sphere dies at elevated temperatures to produce hollow glass hemispheres. The hemispheres are then bonded to an epoxy resin base to produce bilayers with either convex or concave surfaces with radii of curvature down to 4 mm. A tungsten carbide sphere of radius 4 mm (representative of dental cuspal radii)1,23 is used to apply an axisymmetric load
on the specimen top surfaces. This choice of sphere radius is not critical, because radial cracking is insensitive to conditions at the surface contact.\textsuperscript{24} Radial crack evolution is followed \textit{in situ} using a video camera system. Results are interpreted using a finite element analysis (FEA) of the stress states at the brittle layer undersurfaces. It is demonstrated that increasing positive (convex) surface curvature can raise the load to initiate the first cracks, but that this same curvature can diminish the loads to ultimate failure.

**EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURE**

Glass/epoxy layer structures were fabricated to model dental systems with curved surfaces, as indicated in Figure 1. Boro-silicate silicate glass (D263, Menzel-Glaser, Postfach, Germany) was chosen as the brittle layer, in the form of plates 75 $\times$ 50 $\times$ 1 mm. This glass has a Young’s modulus of 73 GPa, close to that of dental enamel or crown porcelains. Epoxy resin (Resin R2512, ATL Composites, Southport, Australia) was chosen as the support material, because of its ease in molding to the shape of the glass overlayer and for its good bonding qualities.

To obtain curved surfaces, the glass plates were slumped over stainless steel balls of prescribed radii and subjected to a heat treatment. To prevent the glass from sticking to the steel spheres, the heated spheres were sprayed with kiln wash (50 wt % Kaolin + 50 wt % alumina hydrate, mixed with 5 parts by volume of distilled water) at $\sim$230°C. The sprayed film was then lightly smoothed with a lint-free cloth. The glass plates were then subjected to the following heat treatment, in air: (1) heat to $\sim$750°C and hold until the glass plates conform to the spherical die curvature; (2) rapid cool to solidify the plates; (3) anneal at $\sim$560°C and cool slowly to room temperature to avoid any residual stresses. Glass surfaces with inner radii of curvature $r_s = \infty$ (flat), 20, 15, 11, 8, and 4 mm were prepared in this way. The glass retained its original thickness of 1 mm during this treatment.

The prospective undersurfaces of the glass plates were given an abrasion treatment with 50 $\mu$m sand particles using a dental sandblast machine (P-G4000, Harnish & Rieth, Winterbach, Germany). Sandblasting is used by dental practitioners to remove excess material at the inner surfaces of crowns, as well as to enhance subsequent bonding to the residual tooth structure.\textsuperscript{25} In our case, the treatment introduces surface flaws and thereby reduces the strength level of the glass close to that of porcelain (which fails from internal microstructural flaws). Most important, it favors preferential radial crack initiation at the glass undersurface, eliminating complications from premature cone cracking at the top surface.\textsuperscript{6,15} Some undersurfaces were left in their as-formed state, for comparison.

The glass plates were then fitted into a mold of the same lateral dimensions, with the hemispherical protrusion facing either outward [convex surfaces, $r_s > 0$, Figure 1(a)] or inward [concave surfaces, $r_s < 0$, Figure 1(b)], and with the abraded surface always facing inward. Epoxy resin was then poured slowly into the mold to a substrate depth of about 15 mm, with intermittent vibration to remove air bubbles. Indentation tests were carried out in air using a tungsten carbide sphere of radius $r_i = 4$ mm mounted in a screw-driven mechanical testing machine (Instron 4301, Instron Corp., Canton, MA). Care was taken to align the sphere and specimen axes so that the contact occurred axisymmetrically. Loads up to 2000 N could be attained in this configuration. During loading, the specimens were viewed from the side and slightly from above using a video camera, such that the contact and side walls of the specimen were within the field of view at all times (although not as clearly in the more concave specimens, where the sphere obstructed the surface view). A light source was placed behind the specimens to optimize crack visibility. A single-cycle axisymmetric indentation was performed on each specimen, and critical loads to initiate radial cracks at the glass undersurfaces were monitored. Subsequent propagation of the radial cracks with further increase in the loading was then followed to the point of failure (where applicable); that is, when the cracks reached the extremities of the curved surfaces. The indentation loading rate was $\sim$10 N $\cdot$ s$^{-1}$. Some 5 to 10 separate tests were run at each surface radius for the convex specimens, and three
tests per surface radius for the concave specimens. No delamination was observed between the glass and epoxy in any of the tests until ultimate failure, attesting to the good bonding.

Finite element modeling was used to compute stresses in the glass layers, specifically the tensile hoop (tangential) stress at the undersurface. Algorithms for such calculations have been well documented in the literature. Here, we used a procedure described by Ford et al., using ABAQUS software. The specimen geometries were those of Figure 1, with lateral dimensions $8 \times 8$ mm and thickness $6 \text{ mm} + r_s$. Input Young’s modulus and Poisson’s ratio were 73 GPa and 0.21 for the glass, 3.4 GPa and 0.33 for the epoxy, and 614 GPa and 0.3 for the tungsten carbide indenter. The meshes were systematically refined, particularly in the critical glass undersurface region, until the solutions attained convergence. Loads were applied monotonically over the experimental range from 0 to 2000 N.

**RESULTS**

**Crack Morphology**

Representative photographs from video sequences demonstrate the main effects of surface curvature on radial crack evolution.

**Figure 2.** Radial cracks in glass layer of thickness 1 mm with abraded undersurface on epoxy resin substrate, from loading with WC sphere of radius $r_i = 4$ mm at load $P = 1500$ N: (a) flat surface, $r_s = \infty$, (b) convex surface, $r_s = 8$ mm, (c) concave surface, $r_s = -8$ mm. [Note change of scale in Figure 2(c).]

**Figure 3.** Video sequence showing radial crack evolution in glass layer of thickness 1 mm with abraded undersurface on epoxy resin substrate, from loading with WC sphere of radius $r_i = 4$ mm on a convex surface of radius $r_s = 4$ mm: loads (a) $P = 200$ N, (b) $P = 400$ N, (c) $P = 700$ N, (d) $P = 743$ N.
geometry. Figure 2 compares crack patterns in specimens with surface radius (a) \( r_s = \infty \) (flat), (b) \( r_s = 8 \) mm (convex), and (c) \( r_s = -8 \) mm (concave), for common indentation load \( P = 1500 \) N and undersurface sandblast abrasion treatment. Figure 2(a, b) was taken in situ, Figure 2(c) after unloading (cracks obscured by indenter in concave specimen). An exaggerated radial crack propagation in the convex surface relative to the flat surface is clearly evident. In Figure 2(b), some radial arms have extended to the hemispherical base, whereas in Figure 2(a) they remain confined to the locality of the indenter. The latter confinement is even more evident in the concave specimens [Figure 2(c)], where the radial crack arms are to some degree encompassed by outer ring cracks at the top surface;\(^{15}\) confined crack patterns of this type were evident in all concave specimens. Ring cracks were also visible at the top surface of the flat and convex surfaces after unloading, but were less restrictive, suggesting that they occurred after initiation of the radials in these overloading and undersurface-abrasion conditions.

Figure 3 shows a sequence of video clips during indentation of a convex surface with surface radius \( r_s = 4 \) mm, undersurface again abraded. Some cracks appear to initiate after others, but may still overtake their predecessors and ultimately become dominant. Notwithstanding these variations, the crack evolution pattern was relatively reproducible in the abraded specimens. Steady propagation of the radial cracks from the near-contact zone to the base of the hemispherical surface and through the thickness of the glass layer was a consistent feature of convex specimens. At higher loads, the radial cracks linked up at their base, causing separation and dislodgement of triangular glass segments [Figure 3(d)]. Top surface ring cracks were apparent in the unloaded specimens, but again were preceded by the radials.

More variability was observed in the crack patterns for unabraded glass surfaces, especially in the initial stages. Generally, higher loads were required to form the cracks, and the ensuing pop-in was more abrupt. The radial crack densities also tended to be lower than in the unabraded surfaces, and the preferential extension of some arms relative to their neighbors more erratic. At higher loads, however, the radials extended steadily, as in abraded surfaces. In some highly convex specimens, the initiation load was so high that the radial cracks popped-in without interruption to the base, resulting in instantaneous failure, as in Figure 4.

Quantitative Radial Crack Evolution

Critical loads \( P_R \) to initiate subsurface radial cracks in the curved glass surfaces were measured as a function of specimen curvature \( r_s^{-1} \). Data are plotted in Figure 5 for abraded and unabraded specimens and for convex and concave surfaces, as means and standard deviation bounds. Solid lines are from FEA computations, using best-fit strengths \( S = 75 \) MPa for abraded surfaces and \( S = 295 \) MPa for unabraded glass (typical values for abraded and as-polished glass surfaces\(^{15}\)) to determine critical loads. The computations do not pass through all the data, especially for unabraded surfaces, but do at least account for the principal data trends. Interestingly, the FEA critical load function passes through a minimum a little below \( r_s^{-1} = 0 \), approaching a factor of 2 increase at the extremities of the curvature range covered.

Figure 6 shows typical plots of circumferential radial crack length \( s \) (i.e., crack length measured around the curved undersurface) as a function of indenter load, for abraded convex specimens of specified radius \( r_s \). The data for the flat surface were truncated at the maximum available load 2000 N. Analogous data for concave surfaces could not be obtained as easily because of obstruction by the indenter, but those available from postmortem examinations [e.g., Figure 2(c)] indicate slight shifts to the left of the \( r_s = 0 \) curve. In the convex surfaces, the popped-in radial cracks first extend

![Figure 4](Image 46x564 to 286x738)
Figure 4. Complete failure of glass layer of thickness 1 mm with unabraded undersurface on epoxy resin substrate, from loading with WC sphere of radius \( r_i = 4 \) mm at load \( P = 710 \) N on a convex surface of radius \( r_s = 4 \) mm.

![Figure 5](Image 312x114 to 547x299)
Figure 5. Critical load \( P_R \) to initiate radial cracks in glass layer of thickness 1 mm with abraded glass undersurfaces, as function of glass surface curvature \( r_s^{-1} \). Loading with WC sphere of radius \( r_i = 4 \) mm. Data shown for abraded and unabraded surfaces, means and standard deviations. Solid lines are FEA computations.
steadily with increasing load [e.g., Figure 3(a, b)], but then propagate relatively abruptly to the base of the hemispherical cap [Figure 3(c)], with increasing abruptness at smaller $r_s$. Still further increase in load does not extend the cracks onto the surrounding flat surface of the glass plate but instead causes linkage of neighboring radial arms and, ultimately, material dislodgement [Figure 3(d)]. This final stage in the failure process is indicated in Figure 6 by vertical arrows. The loads to achieve crack propagation to the base [i.e., Figure 3(c)] are summarized in Figure 7 over all such tests, for both abraded and unabraded specimens. Whereas the effect of surface curvature on this “failure” condition is strongly evident in Figure 7, that of the surface flaw state is not as pronounced.

An attempt at a theoretical analysis of the propagation characteristics for popped-in radial cracks has previously been made for flat surfaces, taking into account the effect of stress gradients at the coating undersurface on the stress–intensity factor. Extension of such analysis to curved surfaces lies beyond the scope of the present study. Nevertheless, simple FEA computations shed some insight into the influence of surface curvature. Figure 8 plots the radial distribution of hoop tensile stress at the glass undersurface for representative convex ($r_s = 8$ mm), flat ($r_s = \infty$) and concave ($r_s = -8$ mm) layers at a common indentation load ($P = 200$ N). Note that some of the curves in the plot cross each other. The tensile stresses along the contact axis are maximum in the flat layers, accounting for the relatively low critical loads for radial crack initiation in Figure 5. At the same time, the range of these tensile stresses is longer in the convex layers and shorter in the concave layers, enhancing the later stages of crack propagation in the former case but confining them in the latter.

**DISCUSSION**

We have investigated the initiation and propagation of radial cracks in curved brittle coating layers on compliant substrates from axisymmetric contacts at the top surface. The results highlight the importance of surface curvature in the fracture behavior. Generally, it requires higher contact loads to initiate radial cracks in curved surfaces (Figure 5), most notably in convex but also in concave surfaces—the curvature diminishes the undersurface tensile stress immediately below the
contact (Figure 8). It follows that widely practiced tests on model flat-layer surfaces provide useful conservative estimates for first radial cracking in more convoluted geometries. The influence of curvature is felt more strongly in the propagation stages of radial fracture in convex surfaces, not so much immediately after pop-in but in a more profound manner as the cracks extend around the circumference, where the cracks abruptly accelerate toward the hemispherical base (Figure 6). The reason for the accelerated failure is to be found in the greater spatial range of tensile stresses in the more positively curved surfaces (Figure 8). Hence the failure load, here defined as that required to propagate radial cracks to the support base, diminishes systematically with increasing convexity (Figure 7). Further increased loading ultimately causes the radial cracks to link at the base, dislodging material segments [Figures 3(d) and 4].

The results in this study are highly relevant to the failure of ceramic-based dental crowns. As mentioned, radial cracking is widely believed to be a principal mode of crown failure. Convex surfaces would seem to be especially vulnerable to sudden crack propagation through the entirety of the crown. The crown must then be replaced—prolonged oral function can only lead to severe fragmentation. The clear message is to avoid sharp convex curvatures in the crown construction. Use of the present data to make quantitative predictions of failure are more ambitious, for several reasons: we have used epoxy resin as the outerlayer support, which is considerably less stiff than dentin; tooth geometry is more convoluted than the simple curved surfaces used herein; our experiments have used only 1 mm layer thicknesses—thinner layers will diminish the loads required to initiate and propagate the radial cracks; real crowns are not “built-in” to a flat surround layer, but are cemented at their margins to the tooth structure; we have considered only single-cycle loading—slow crack growth and fatigue in the repeat loading that characterizes oral function must exacerbate the failure process, and may even introduce new modes of failure, especially in aqueous environments. Nevertheless, the methodology does provide useful guidelines for data trends.

The results for concave surfaces pertain to the failure of ceramic acetabular cup liners for total hip replacements. Again, tests on flat layers may be used to provide a conservative baseline for estimating failure loads. In this case, the fractures are more likely to remain localized around the contact site rather than propagate to the edges of the device. However, once damage is initiated, continued articulating contact with a ceramic ball joint can only exacerbate wear and lead to more severe damage, in which case the critical load for radial crack initiation may be considered to define an effective failure condition.

An issue that requires attention is that of flaw state. Radial crack initiation at the brittle undersurface is determined when the tensile stress exceeds the strength (at least to first approximation). The sandblast treatment used in our experiments to reduce strength variability of the glass plates diminishes the critical load for first fracture by introducing larger surface flaws (Figure 5). However, this may not be a major factor in the porcelains and other polycrystalline ceramic materials used in real crowns, because those materials already contain a profusion of internal microstructural flaws. In any case, once the radial crack has popped in and begins its propagation, it is the intrinsic material toughness that governs the mechanics, and flaw state becomes a much less important factor in the ultimate failure condition (Figure 8).

The authors gratefully acknowledge useful discussions with Chris Ford, Matthew Rudas, Yu Zhang, and Do Kyung Kim. Information of product names and suppliers in this article is not to imply endorsement by NIST.

REFERENCES